Faculty Review Process (effective Fall, 2020)

IX. Faculty Status Review
Faculty status review begins in the fall semester and proceeds according to reasonable deadlines established annually by the University Provost. The review process pertains to renewal, non-renewal, promotion, tenure, sabbatical leaves, and emeritus status for faculty. For all Faculty Status matters, where there is no Chair the College Dean or School Dean/Director sends the request to faculty informing them of the deadlines when they are going to be reviewed.

1. First Level of Peer Review (FLPR)
1.1 Composition and Selection
1.1.1 Composition. The FLPR shall be composed of six (6) tenured members of the department or school except as indicated in 1.1.2 below. In departments or schools having fewer than six (6) tenured members, all tenured members except the Department Chair, Deputy Chair(s) who have participated in the review process, and Faculty Evaluator(s) as defined in 1.3.4, shall serve.

1.1.2 Eligibility. In departments or schools having fewer than six (6) tenured members, the Committee shall include tenured faculty from any department or school with expertise that relates to the discipline of the department or school so as to bring the membership up to no less than four (4) and no more than six (6). Such additional members shall be chosen by majority vote of the inviting department's or school's tenured members and the invitation communicated by the department or school.

1.1.3 Voting. Each department or school, where necessary, shall hold an election for the FLPR by secret ballot. All full-time members of the department or school shall be eligible to vote in such election.

1.1.4 Multi-Discipline. In the case of multi-discipline departments, if possible each discipline shall have at least (1) representative on the FLPR.

1.1.5 Multi-Campus. In the case of multi-campus departments, the departments shall insure adequate representation from each campus.

1.2 Operation
1.2.1 Notice of Meetings. All members of the FLPR shall receive timely notice of all meetings.

1.2.2 Chair. The FLPR shall elect an FLPR Chair at its first meeting of the academic year which shall be convened by the Department Chair or School Dean/Director no later than October 1.

1.2.3 Quorum. Four (4) voting members of the Committee shall constitute a quorum. Faculty who participate in and/or vote in a faculty status matter at any level (FLPR, SLPR) shall not be eligible to participate and/or vote on the same faculty status matter at a different level. Such faculty members shall be required to recuse themselves.

1.2.4 Recusal. A member of the FLPR must withdraw from the deliberations while his or her case is being considered.

1.2.5 Additional Procedures. The FLPR may establish additional operational procedures consistent with University policies and regulations and the Faculty Handbook. Such procedures, once established, shall be disseminated to all faculty in the department or school.

1.3 Process
1.3.1 Notice to Faculty. The Department Chair or School Dean/Director shall send a request to all members of the department or school asking if they are seeking faculty status review in the current year and, if so, the action for which they wish to be considered. Based on the responses, the Department Chair or School Dean/Director shall compile a list of cases to be considered and forward it to the FLPR. Normally, a faculty member is ineligible for faculty status review of an action if the decision from the preceding academic year relating to the same action is being appealed to the University Grievance Committee.
1.3.2 Information from Faculty. The individual being reviewed shall provide the Department Chair or School Dean/Director with a current Faculty Activity Summary (see Appendix A, page 46) and other supporting materials. The Department Chair or School Dean/Director shall transmit these materials to the FLPR. The FLPR shall review the individual’s official personnel file to ensure that all relevant information is before the FLPR.

1.3.3 FLPR’s Recommendation. The FLPR’s recommendation in each case shall be made in writing by its Chair and shall be signed by all members present. It shall give the exact vote in each case, while assuring the anonymity of individual votes, and it shall give specific and detailed reasons for the positive and negative votes and for any abstentions. Members of the FLPR dissenting from the majority vote may submit a minority report, which shall be attached to the majority recommendation. The FLPR’s recommendation shall be transmitted by the FLPR Chair to the Department Chair or School Dean/Director. The School Dean/Director shall forward the FLPR’s recommendation to the Faculty Evaluator(s) as defined in 1.3.4.

1.3.4 Evaluations. Upon receipt of the FLPR’s recommendation, the Department Chair shall make an independent evaluation, which will be included in the packet forwarded to the SLPR, concerning the faculty member’s application and shall give specific and detailed reasons for this evaluation. In the absence of a Department chair, the school faculty shall elect tenured faculty as Faculty Evaluator(s) to provide independent letters of evaluation for all faculty actions. These evaluation letters shall be sent directly to the SLPR by the Faculty Evaluator(s).

1.3.5 Copy to Faculty Member. The Department Chair or School Dean/Director shall forward to the faculty member copies of the evaluation and the FLPR’s recommendation at the time they are forwarded to the SLPR.

1.3.6 Additional Information. Upon receipt of the FLPR recommendation and Chair/Faculty Evaluator evaluations, the faculty member may submit an additional statement and/or supporting documents to the College Dean or School Dean/Director. The College Dean or School Dean/Director shall forward such statement to the SLPR.

2. SECOND LEVEL OF PEER REVIEW (SLPR)

2.1 Composition and Selection

2.1.1 Members. Each College or School SLPR shall be composed of seven or nine (7 or 9) tenured faculty members. Across all Colleges or Schools, members of this committee shall be elected by the full-time faculty of the College or School, and shall serve for staggered three (3)-year terms. No faculty status action may be taken by any SLPR with fewer than five (5) members voting.

For colleges with departments, the SLPR shall be composed of seven or nine (7 or 9) tenured faculty members from across the departments, if possible at least five (5) should come from different departments with a limit of two (2) faculty members from a given department.

For independent schools, SLPR shall be composed of seven or nine (7 or 9) tenured faculty members from across the independent Schools, if possible at least five (5) should come from different independent schools with a limit of two (2) faculty members from a given school.

2.1.2 Limit on Departments. Where College or independent School structure permits, there shall be no more than two (2) faculty members per department or school. Exceptions to this rule may be made by the college or school faculty. In the case of multi-campus colleges or schools, there shall be no fewer than two (2) members per campus.

2.1.3 Recusal. No faculty member shall be a member of the SLPR during any year in which he or she is to be considered for any faculty status action with the exception of a faculty member requesting only a sabbatical leave. Any member of the SLPR must withdraw from the deliberations while a member of his or her own department or independent school is being considered. Faculty who participate in a faculty status matter at the FLPR level shall not be eligible to participate in the same faculty status matter at the SLPR level. Such faculty members shall be required to recuse themselves.

2.1.4 Evaluators Ineligible. Department Chairs, Deputy Chairs who participated in the review process and Faculty Evaluator(s) are ineligible for membership on the SLPR.
2.2 Operation

2.2.1 Authority. In all personnel matters, the recommendation of the SLPR shall constitute the recommendation of the College or Schools Faculty.

2.2.2 Chair. The SLPR shall elect its own Chair at its first meeting of the academic year, which shall be convened by the College Dean or, in the case of independent schools, by the School Directors, no later than October 1.

2.2.3 Quorum. Five (5) voting members of the SLPR shall constitute a quorum.

2.2.4 Notice of Meetings. All members of the SLPR shall receive timely notice of all meetings.

2.2.5 Additional Procedures. Other specific operational procedures of the SLPR may be established by the Committee and the College or independent School faculty. Such procedures must be consistent with University policy and regulations and the Faculty Handbook.

2.3 Process

2.3.1 Material to Review. The College Dean or School Dean/Director shall make available to the SLPR the recommendation of the FLPR and the evaluation, including the complete personnel file and any written statements from the faculty member. All will be included in the package received by the SLPR.

The SLPR shall review all materials made available by or received from the College Dean or School Dean/Director.

2.3.2 Faculty Statements. In considering any statement submitted to it by the faculty member in response to the FLPR recommendation, the Committee shall take the following action:

(a) Allegation of Defect If the statement alleges that, in reaching their recommendation, the FLPR failed to follow the appropriate evaluation procedures or standards, then the SLPR initially shall determine whether there is merit to that allegation. It shall not seek to substitute its judgment on the merits of the faculty member’s faculty status case for that of the FLPR. If the SLPR finds that the allegation has merit, it shall request reconsideration by the FLPR and specify the respects in which the FLPR failed to follow the appropriate procedures and standards. Once there has been an opportunity to remedy the alleged procedural defect, the case shall be considered on its merits by the SLPR.

(b) New Information If the faculty member’s statement and/or supporting documents contain information which had not been made available to the FLPR, the SLPR may request reconsideration by the FLPR or it may consider the case at that time. In the latter event, the Committee shall notify the FLPR, giving them an opportunity to make a revised recommendation.
2.3.3 Committee Recommendation. After the review has been completed, the recommendation of the SLPR shall be presented in writing by the Committee Chair and shall be signed by all members present and voting. The reasons for the Committee’s recommendation shall be stated with particularity, and the recommendation shall indicate the expressed reasons for votes, positive, negative, or abstentions. The recommendation shall state the exact vote of the Committee, while preserving the anonymity of individual votes. Members of the SLPR dissenting from the majority opinion may submit a minority report, which shall be transmitted to the College Dean or School Dean/Director and the University Provost with the recommendation of the majority.

2.3.4 Dean/Director’s Recommendation. Upon receipt of the SLPR recommendation, the College Dean or School Dean/Director shall make an independent recommendation concerning the faculty member’s status and shall give specific reasons for this recommendation. The College Dean or School Dean/Director shall advise the SLPR of his or her position in writing.

2.3.5 Reconciliation of Differences. In the event of substantial disagreement, the College Dean or School Dean/Director and the SLPR shall meet to discuss their differences. At the time of the notification provided for in Section IX.2.3.6 below, the faculty member shall be apprised of the occurrence of such a meeting. In the event of such a meeting, either the Committee or the College Dean or School Dean/Director may request further information from the faculty member or the department.

2.3.6 Information to Faculty Member. The College Dean or School Dean/Director shall advise the faculty member and the FLPR Chair of his or her recommendation, and that of the SLPR, at the time these recommendations are forwarded to the University Provost. The faculty member shall be provided with copies of these recommendations, and copies shall be placed in his or her personnel file. Upon receipt of the recommendations of the College Dean or the School Dean/Director, and that of the SLPR, the faculty member and/or FLPR may provide additional comment or information to the University Provost.

2.3.7 University Provost Decision. If, after the conference described in Section IX.2.3.5 above, there is still disagreement between the SLPR and the College Dean or School Dean/Director the University Provost shall make a decision based upon the various recommendations and supporting documents. The reasons for such a decision shall be stated with particularity and transmitted to all parties.

2.3.8 University Provost Override of College. In the event that the SLPR and the College Dean or School Dean/Director concur, the University Provost shall approve their recommendations, except in unusual circumstances for compelling reasons which must arise from overriding University concerns and which shall be stated in writing and forwarded to the College Dean or School Dean/Director, the SLPR, the FLPR, and the affected faculty member.
Transition Process
Faculty Status Reviews

This Transition Process for faculty status reviews is a supplement to the revised Faculty Handbook (2020 Edition).

The faculty status review process pertains to renewal, non-renewal, promotion, tenure, sabbatical leaves, and emeritus status for faculty. The principles reflected in the Faculty Handbook and this supplement are not intended to interfere with evolving standards of academic performance as may be applied over the years in a fair and transparent manner. Criteria for academic excellence is not a static construct, and the goal is not to prevent evolving standards, but rather to assure that faculty members have appropriate opportunity to meet any changing standards as set by the academic community and leadership in the normal course.

In addition to the criteria for reviews already set forth in the Faculty Handbook, reviews related to renewals, non-renewal or tenure, promotions to associate professor and promotion to full professor within 5 years of the reorganization shall be guided by the following two principles:

1. Reviews that are performed after a reorganization of the department, school, or college shall respect and be informed by the standards for academic performance that were reflected in the individual’s reviews prior to the reorganization, as documented as part of the prior reviews. For faculty in their second year and undergoing their initial review, faculty shall be reviewed under the standards in place at the time of their hiring. Faculty shall have reasonable assurance that their efforts to achieve the criteria conveyed to them as part of the review process prior to the reorganization shall continue to apply following the reorganization.

2. Reviews shall take into account that facilities and resources differ across campuses, and faculty shall be evaluated based on their use of the available facilities and resources.